



# **NINTH GOVERNING BODY MEETING**

**OF**

**KARNATAKA EVALUATION AUTHORITY**

**CHAired BY**

**CHAIRPERSON OF KEA GOVERNING BODY**

**&**

**PRINCIPAL SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT OF  
KARNATAKA**

**PLANNING, PROGRAMME MONITORING AND  
STATISTICS DEPARTMENT**

**DATE: 25 JUNE 2015**

**TIME: 11.00 AM**

**VENUE**

**Committee Room**

**No. 253, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, 2<sup>nd</sup> Gate,**

**M.S. Building, Bangalore 560 002.**

## **AGENDA SUBJECT 1**

### **TO CONFIRM THE RESOLUTIONS OF THE 8<sup>TH</sup> GOVERNING BODY MEETING OF KEA HELD ON 31<sup>ST</sup> MARCH 2015.**

The Governing Body is requested to confirm the resolutions and please note the action taken on subjects where action was called for, which are-

- I. **Agenda subject 2:** The decision taken regarding the remuneration/honoraria for payable to Independent Assessors has been notified vide Office Memorandum number KEA 138 EVN 2014 dated 06<sup>th</sup> April 2015 and being followed.
- II. **Agenda subject 3:** No action needed as accounts of current receipts and disbursements was not an item where any comments/suggestions were made.
- III. **Agenda subject 4:** It is learnt that the transition from HRMS 1 to 2 is now taking place. Having a study of HRMS is not found to be capable of being done easily. Hence, recommendation is in favour of dropping the study.
- IV. **Agenda subject 5:** In accordance with the decision of the Governing Body the services of Consultant Evaluation is being continued through Manpower agency. In the previous meeting, it could not be brought to the notice of the Governing Body that as per paragraphs 7 and 8 of Government of Karnataka order number PD 22 SMC 2013 dated 11<sup>th</sup> February 2014, retired Government Servants could be appointed to any post in KEA with the approval of the Governing Body by the Principal Secretary, Planning department on such terms and conditions as the Governing Body deems appropriate. The Governing Body is requested to please consider the case in the light of this provision and permit engagement of Mr. S.A.Katarki as Consultant Evaluation at the same

terms and conditions as approved in this subject resolution in the last meeting of the Governing Body.

- V. **Agenda subject 6:** The contract with KIPA has been extended by entering into a fresh agreement with them valid for one year.
- VI. **Agenda subject 7:** The contract period has been extended up to 31<sup>st</sup> May 2015. Thereafter, as committed in the subject in the previous Governing Body meeting, a fresh tender has been called. Its outcome is to be decided under agenda subject 6 of this meeting.
- VII. **Agenda subject 8:** The action directed by the Governing Body has been taken and it forms part of subject number 5 of this meeting.
- VIII. **Agenda subject 9:** The decision of payment of “satisfactory service allowance” has been implemented by sanctioning it to meriting manpower and for the period for which it is merited.
- IX. **Agenda subject 10:** The engagement of an ISO Consultant has been done. Action is being taken to conform to ISO standards by codifying our procedures, building in a formal system of feedback and improvement and formalising employee and visitor friendly practices and safety measures as the standards require. The Governing Body will be informed of all developments that take place in this matter.

## **AGENDA SUBJECT 2**

### **TO FURNISH THE ACCOUNTS OF CURRENT RECEIPTS AND DISBURSEMENTS OF THE YEAR 2015-16 UP TO MAY 2015**

The following is the summary of receipts and expenditure up to the end  
of May 2015 for the year 2015-16

#### **EXPENDITURE STATEMENT**

<b>Sl. no.</b>	<b>Particulars</b>	<b>Amount in Rs.</b>
1	Schemes Evaluation Expenses	1228564
2	Salary & Allowances	575230
3	Salary for Outsource Staff (KEA) (HDD)	1037251
4	Leave Encashment	0
5	Pension & Leave Salary contribution	0
6	Workshop, Training, Seminar and Meeting Expenses of HDD	5078
7	Payment to Resource Persons (KEA)	12000
8	Meeting Expenses KEA (Technical Meeting)	27310
9	Sitting Fees, Conveyance and Travelling Expenses	9000
10	Books and Periodicals-newspaper (KEA) (HDD)	700
11	Notification Expenses (Advertisement)	108189
12	HR and Accounts Manual Preparation	0
13	Printing and Stationery & Consumables	12603
14	Telephone and Postage – (KEA, HDD)	11052
15	Office Expenses	0
16	Vehicle Maintenance	0
17	Petrol of KEA and HDD Vehicles	16834
18	Bank Charges	1714
19	Furniture and Fixtures KEA	0
20	a) Release to Zilla Panchayats (towards preparation of DHDRS	1350000

	b)Release to Zilla Panchayats towards Printing of DHD Reports	0
21	Audit Charges	0
22	Vehicle hiring charges	239600
23	Filing IT return & Misc.	5163
24	Medical Reimbursement	0
<b>Total</b>		<b>4640288</b>

### **RECEIPT STATEMENT**

<b>Sl. no</b>	<b>Receipt from</b>	<b>Amount inRs.</b>
1	Opening Balance	86526669.56
2	a)Grant in Aid from State Government	0
3	b)Deposits for the sponsored Evaluation studies form other departments/agencies	0
4	c)Interest on Bank Deposits	230777
5	d)Grant in Aid from Government of India/UNDP etc	0
6	e)EMD from Agencies	0
7	f)Refunds	0
8	g)Miscellaneous (application fee etc.)	20010
<b>Total</b>		<b>86777456.56</b>

The balance in the “KEA Fund” account was Rs. 82137168.56 (Rupees Eight Crore Twenty One Lakh Thirty Seven Thousand One Hundred Sixty Eight and paisa Fifty Six) as on 31<sup>st</sup> May 2015.

The accounts of the 2015-16 are being maintained as per the provisions of the KEA Finance and Accounts Manual.

**The Governing Body is requested to please note the above details and offer suggestions where felt necessary.**

### **AGENDA SUBJECT 3**

#### **APPROVAL OF THE BUDGET FOR 2015-16**

An outlay of Rs. 300 lakhs has been sanctioned for KEA for the year 2015-16. An amount of Rs 13.50 lakhs has been received by the KEA over and above this allotment from the department of Health and Family Welfare for evaluation of Madilu scheme. There are indications that an amount of Rs 25 lakhs will be released by other departments for evaluations this year. The budget prepared for the year 2015-16 is enclosed along with this subject.

**It is requested that the budget may be discussed by the Governing Body and adopted, after such changes as may be felt to be required, and taken to the General Body in the next meeting for approval in accordance with the rule no. 14(3) of the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) Rules, 2011.**

#### **PROPOSED BUDGET OF KEA FOR THE YEAR 2015-16**

<b>Sl .no</b>	<b>Name/Type of work</b>	<b>Allocation in lakh Rupees</b>
1	Salaries and Establishment cost of KEA staff.	60.00
2	Office expenses, Operations and Maintenance expenses of KEA.	40.00
3	Providing support to HDD( DHDR & SHDR Preparation).	38.00
4	Conducting Evaluation studies (including payment for evaluations carried over to this financial year).	146.00
5	Conducting Training Programmes for government employees and departments with regard to capacity Building, including preparing Training Manual etc.	16.00
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>300.00</b>

**AGENDA SUBJECT 4**

**APPROVAL OF THE REPORT OF THE GOVERNING BODY ON THE  
AFFAIRS OF KEA FOR THE YEAR 2014-15 FOR PLACING BEFORE  
THE GENERAL BODY**

As per rule 11(2) (i) of the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) Rules 2011, it is required that the report of the Governing Body on the Affairs of the Society, including the progress made in its programs in furtherance of its aims and objectives pertaining to the previous financial year be placed before the General Body.

**The draft report of 2014-15 intended to be placed before the fourth General Body meeting is enclosed.**

**It is requested that the Governing Body may please discuss and suggest changes which may be incorporated in it. After such changes as are suggested, the report will be placed before the General Body.**



## **AGENDA SUBJECT 5**

### **FINALIZING THE TOPICS/SCHEMES FOR EXTERNAL EVALUATIONS FROM THOSE PROPOSED BY VARIOUS DEPARTMENTS AND PARASTALS FOR 2015-16.**

In the eighth subject of the previous (eighth) Governing Body meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015, the decision was as follows-

*“The CEO, KEA, should write to all departments and Planning Directors to inform the KEA in April 2015 about the schemes and programmes which they would like to get evaluated in the year 2015-16 at their cost (Internal evaluation), and those which they want to get evaluated at KEA cost (External evaluation). Based upon the information received, the annual plan of Evaluations may be prepared”.*

The following proposals for External Evaluation (other than those already decided to be Externally Evaluated in 2015-16 or a carry-over from 2014-15) has been received from the departments and parastatals in response to the letters written to all ACS/Principal Secretaries/Secretaries requesting for intimating to KEA the schemes they would like to be evaluated in 2015-16 after Terms of Reference for those are prepared and sanctioned by the Technical Committee of the KEA, namely-

<b>Sl. no</b>	<b>Department/Parastatal</b>	<b>Scheme/Topic of evaluation study</b>
1.	Health and Family Welfare (Rs 13.50 lacs is released by them to KEA)	Evaluation of the Madilu Programme of <i>Samagra Mathru Aarogya Palane</i> scheme.(ToR is sanctioned in the 18 <sup>th</sup> Technical Committee meeting of KEA)
2.	Cooperation	Evaluation of the <i>Yeshasvini</i> Cooperative farmer's health care scheme.
3.	PWD	Evaluation of the <i>Chief Minister's Grameena</i>

		<i>Raste Abhivrudhi</i> scheme.
4.	PWD	Evaluation of the State Highways development scheme. Phase I.
5.	PWD	Evaluation of the State Highways development scheme. Phase II
6.	Planning, Plan Monitoring and Statistics	Evaluation of the impact of the Drought mitigating interventions for Additional Fodder Production Programme (AFDP) under RKVY
7.	Women and Child Development	Evaluation of the <i>Bhagyalakshmi</i> scheme.
8.	Planning, Plan Monitoring and Statistics	Status of some of the malignant and exploitative superstitions of Karnataka and the change in their status of prevalence in the past 25 years.
9.	Planning, Plan Monitoring and Statistics	Study of the migration of labour within and to outside the State of Karnataka.
10.	Planning, Plan Monitoring and Statistics	Study of the impact of farm mechanization in Karnataka.
11.	Planning, Plan Monitoring and Statistics	Evaluation of the functioning of Day care Old age homes.
12.	Rural Development and Panchayat Raj	Evaluation of the Social and Economic Impact of village roads constructed in NABARD scheme.
13.	Rural Development and Panchayat Raj	Evaluation of the operations and maintenance of multi village schemes.
14.	Rural Development and Panchayat Raj	Status of Gram Panchayat Finances in Karnataka.

15.	Rural Development and Panchayat Raj	Evaluation of the usage of Individual toilets constructed under IHL scheme.
16.	Rural Development and Panchayat Raj	Evaluation of the drinking water and ground water status of multi village schemes.
17.	Tourism	Evaluation of the distribution of Tourist Taxis under SCP, TSP and OBC schemes.
18.	Tourism	Evaluation of the Karnataka <i>darshan</i> programme for SC/ST children of government schools.
19.	Tourism	Evaluation of the construction of <i>yatrinivas</i> and dormitories in tourist places.
20.	Tourism	Evaluation of the development/construction of approach roads to tourist places under SCP and NABARD schemes.
21.	Tourism	Evaluation of the programmes for which approvals were made and funds released under Tourism Policy in the period 2009-14.
22.	Karnataka Women's Development Corporation, Bangalore.	Evaluation of the (a) <i>Udyogini</i> , (b) Training, (c) Micro credit, and, (d) Rehabilitation of Devadasi schemes.
23.	KEONICS	Evaluation of the training imparted under SDP in the most backward taluks of Karnataka.
24.	Devaraj Urs Backward Classes Development Corporation	Evaluation of Ganga Kalyana Scheme from 2008-09 to 2012-13 implemented by Devaraj Urs Backward Classes Development Corporation
25	Horticulture	HOPCOMS

# Ten studies proposed by University of Agricultural Sciences, Bangalore are enclosed as ***Annexure 1***  
. They are but not schemes but evaluation of intervention outcomes.

**The Governing Body is requested to please consider these proposals and decision be taken as to include which of them for getting them Externally Evaluated in the year 2015-16.**

## **AGENDA SUBJECT 6**

### **APPROVAL OF THE TENDER RATES FOR ENGAGING MANPOWER IN KEA FROM 01<sup>ST</sup> JUNE 2015 TO 31<sup>ST</sup> MAY 2017**

In the previous Governing Body meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015, a commitment was given that the KEA will call for a fresh tender to engage one Consultant (Evaluation), one driver, two group D staff, two Office Assistants, one DTP Operator, one Personal Secretary to Chief Evaluation Officer and one Personal Secretary to Administrative Officer against sanctioned posts of these very nomenclature. The accepted tender rates would be effective from 01<sup>st</sup> June 2015.

Accordingly tenders were called on the e-Procurement portal of Government of Karnataka vide notification number KEA 57 EVN 2013 dated 24<sup>th</sup> April 2015. Three valid tenders were received. These were from-

- (a) Hindustan Security Services,  
# 17/1, 20<sup>th</sup> Main, Muneshwara Block, Bangalore- 560085.
- (b) Spywell Detective Agency,  
Ashraya, No. 717/60A, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, 6<sup>th</sup> Main, 5<sup>th</sup> Cross, Vijayanagara,  
Bangalore 560 004.
- (c) S.A Manpower Services Private Limited,  
No. 35/1, “Mandara”, Opposite Reliance Trends, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 11<sup>th</sup>  
Cross, 1<sup>st</sup> Main Road, Bangalore 560 003.

The rate of Hindustan Security Service was the least, but, during doing a verification of a complaint received against it (copy of the complaint is enclosed as ***Annexure 1***), it was found that the company was blacklisted by BESCOM and the period of blacklisting was in force as on the date of opening of tender too. [The proceedings of the office of Tender Accepting Authority dated 21<sup>st</sup> May 2015 and 01<sup>st</sup> June 2015 enclosed as ***Annexures 2 and 3***

respectively(sent to all three bidders) detail the findings and inferences]. Accordingly, under condition number B.2 of the Tender, its bid was rejected.

M/s Spywell and M/s S.A Manpower had both quoted the same rate i.e. of charging 5.1% service charge. They became the L1s. To break the deadlock, negotiations were done. They were asked to separately and secretly quote a rate in writing and give to the Tender Accepting Authority simultaneously by 12:15 hrs of 01<sup>st</sup> June 2015. These quotes were opened in their presence. The rate of M/s S.A Manpower (Service charge 5.00001%) was found to be lower than that of M/s Spywell (Service charge 5.0001%). This interestingly is, **(a) less than the rate quoted by M/s Hindustan Security Service, and (b) less than the rates of service charge (10% in one tender and 8% in other) we are currently paying to the present service providers.**

The Chief Evaluation Officer, KEA, has, vide administrative power number 1.e of the Government of Karnataka order number PD 21 SMC 2013 dated 08<sup>th</sup> March 2013, the power to engage support staff through manpower agencies after taking at least three quotes. This tender being for a period more than six months needs the approval of Governing Body.

In view of the fact that the process prescribed by the Karnataka Transparency in Public Procurement Act and Rules has been followed, the process has been done on e-Procurement portal and further that the rates now received are less than the prevailing rates, **it is requested that the Governing body be pleased to resolve to accept the lowest negotiated rate of 5.00001 % of M/s S.A Manpower Services Private Limited, No. 35/1, “Mandara”, Opposite Reliance Trends, 1st Floor, 11th Cross, 1st Main Road, Bangalore 560 003 and permit KEA to enter into a formal contract with them for the same.**

## **AGENDA SUBJECT 7**

### **NON RECOVERY OF ADVANCE PAYMENT WITH INTEREST FROM M/S. LEKKA CONSULTANCY SERVICES PRIVATE LIMITED, BANGALORE – AUDIT OBJECTION NO. 5 OF 2015.**

1. Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) was constituted in 2011. In the first General Body Meeting held on 07<sup>th</sup> December 2011, approval was accorded for developing a Human Resource Manual and a Finance and Accounts Manual for KEA through M/s. Lekka Consultancy Services Private Limited, Bangalore, at a cost of Rs. 386050. The resolution was implemented vide KEA office order no. PD 34 EVN 2011, dated: 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2011. A copy of the order is enclosed as ***Annexure 1***.
2. In accordance with the payment schedule mentioned to Annexure 1, M/s. Lekka Consultancy Services Private Limited was paid a sum of Rs. 154420 vide cheque no. 133957, dated 27<sup>th</sup> January 2012 of the State Bank of Mysore, M.S. Building Branch, Bangalore.
3. The Agreement made between M/s. Lekka Consultancy Services Private Limited and KEA is enclosed as ***Annexure 2***. Clause 6.2 of the Agreement provides the time schedule of developing the manuals to be 7 weeks; Clause 3.5.4 details that mere submission of final report will not constitute completion of the task but only a letter of acceptance of report by KEA will, and Clauses 6.2.3 and 6.2.4 that if the time schedule (of Clause 6.2) is not adhered to, KEA may revoke the agreement and then will be entitled to the return of advance amount paid to M/s. Lekka Consultancy Services Private Limited, with 24% interest per annum.

4. It is seen from the file on the subject available in KEA that the company did prepare the two manuals. These were reviewed at least on 16<sup>th</sup> October 2012 and 27<sup>th</sup> March 2013. The proceedings of the 27<sup>th</sup> March 2013 meeting enclosed as ***Annexure 3*** would evidence that the manuals did not meet the approval of the Committee that was formed to review them on behalf of KEA.
5. This was followed by issuance of a show cause notice no. PD 34 EVN 2011/12, dated: 08<sup>th</sup> April 2013 issued by the CEO, KEA to the Director of M/s. Lekka Consultancy Services Private Limited, Bangalore, seeking reasons as to why clauses 6.2.3 and 6.2.4 of the agreement should not be invoked (forfeiture/recovery the advance made with interest). A copy of the notice is enclosed as ***Annexure 4***. Yet another notice on the same lines was issued on 20<sup>th</sup> July 2013 by the CEO, KEA. A copy of that is enclosed as ***Annexure 5***. This has been sent by speed post.
6. Whether as a response to this or otherwise is not known, but it is recorded in the file of KEA that by email a scanned letter of the Director of M/s. Lekka Consultancy Private Limited was received. The email is dated 07<sup>th</sup> August 2013. The Director states in the email to –

*“..... take our latest version of the manual and forfeit the advance payment.....”*

A copy of the said communication is enclosed as ***Annexure 6***.

7. Vide office order no. PD 34 KEA 2013, dated: 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2013, (copy of the order is enclosed as ***Annexure 7***), the CEO, KEA deemed that M/s. Lekka Consultancy Service Private Limited had completed 50% of the work and ordered that to be entitled to a payment of Rs. 193025/-. After such computations as are available in the operative portion of the said order, the payment of Rs. 154420/- made to the company was held fair and valid.



8. In March 2015, the Accountant General conducted the First Audit of KEA and under Audit Enquiry no. 5 objected to this validation of the payment and its non recovery with 24% interest. A copy of the audit objection is enclosed as Annexure 8. KEA has committed to put this subject before the Governing Body for discussion and decision.

**The matter is placed before the Governing Body Meeting for discussion and decision as to what course of action is to be suggested to the KEA in this matter, particularly whether or not to stand by the contents of the office order no. PD 34 KEA 2013, dated: 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2013.**

## **AGENDA SUBJECT 8**

### **APPROVAL OF THE AUDIT REPORT AND ACCOUNTS OF 2014-15**

The Annual accounts of the financial year 2014-15 was prepared and got audited by the auditors appointed by the Governing Body vide resolution no. 8 passed in its fifth meeting held on 26<sup>th</sup> March 2014. The auditor's report, including the supplementary reports and payment statements, the balance sheet and their notes on accounts will be provided at the time of meeting as they are being typed and prepared at the time of drafting of the subject.

**The report, statements and notes put before the Governing Body may please be discussed and changes suggested, after which they will be followed by adopting them and taken to the next General Body meeting for approval in accordance with rule no. 14(3) of the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) Rules, 2011.**