

## Evaluation on Police Public School

### Home Department

#### Executive Summary

The Police Schools were established by the Home Department of Government of Karnataka to provide quality education at an affordable price to the wards of Police Personnel. In a short span of time, the Mysuru and Bengaluru Police Schools have grown in students' strength indicating an enhanced visibility and acceptance of the schools by the Police and Public. The Dharwar Police School is of concern to all the stakeholders as the student strength over the past five years has been below the stipulated number of two hundred and fifty, a strength fixed in the Government Order of 1997.

With each of the three Police Schools functioning as an independent institution, it becomes imperative to study how far have the three Police Schools been able to fulfill the objectives for which they were established?

Thus, the **Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA)** commissioned an evaluation study aimed at thoroughly analyzing the working of the three Police Schools. **Natural Resource India Foundation (NRIF)** conducted this evaluation.

The study assessed the functioning of the three schools over a five year period viz. 2010-2011 to 2014-2015, in terms of (a) Infrastructure (b) Admission Trends (c) Staffing Pattern (d) Fee Structure (e) Staff Development Programmes (f) Student Development and (g) Overall School Governance.

Perspectives of different stakeholders were also obtained to gauge the quality of school programme in each of the school.

## **Findings**

**Major findings of the study, as were presented and approved at the 20<sup>th</sup> Technical Committee meeting of KEA, Chaired by Secretary Planning, Govt. of Karnataka, meeting held on 21st September 2015, are as follows:**

1. Each of these three schools is virtually functioning in isolation with no academic collaboration or commonality in governance, in spite of the common purpose for their establishment. The teachers, students, administrative staff and parents have never had a common forum for meeting.
2. The Police Schools were established to provide quality education at an affordable price. Study reveals that all the three schools need to lay more emphasis on systematizing their processes for achieving the goal of quality education. Though the efforts are being put in this direction, additional focus needs to be given on building quality teaching-learning facilities and in enhancing the curricular programme. This need is highly pronounced in case of N A Muttanna Memorial Police Children's' Residential School, Dharwar, where the school infrastructure and hostel facilities were far below the average standards to support student development.
3. The primary beneficiaries from the Police Schools are the wards of Police Constables of the department. Wards of Head Constables, Police Sub-Inspector and Assistant Sub- Inspector constituted less than 15 % of the of the total strength of Police students over the last five years.

4. No extra niche was seen in any of the Police Schools that could be called an exclusivity of Police Schools. The functioning of Police Schools were no different from any Private School except that they enjoyed a large campus. Emphasis on physical development activities, risk taking adventure activities or activities instilling self discipline and team work were low.
5. Majority( 80%) of the teachers of the three Police Schools wanted improved job conditions in the form of better pay packages, incentives, regular skill upgradation and vertical job mobility.
6. Heads of the three Police Schools had limited freedom in school governance. All the major decisions related to academic and administrative governance were managed by the Executive Secretary of the school governing body.
7. In N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar, the GO drafted in 1997 has created a non-maneuverable model in terms of student intake, the classes run and the Board of affiliation.
8. In Mysore and Koramangala PPSs, the overall development of students in terms of their personality and confidence was good and comparable to any good private school.
9. The 70:30 ratio of distribution of students for Police and non-Police wards respectively with a differential fee structure was found to be a financially viable model for managing the salary and non-salary expenses of these two schools.
10. In case of N A Muttanna school Dharwar, the number of applications for Kannada medium has been reducing due to students' parents preference for English Medium courses.

**On the basis of the findings, the following recommendations are suggested:**

Police-Public School is an assured model for providing affordable education to wards of police personnel.. It is a kind of emotional assurance and an incentive for the hard working Police Personnel. The three Police Schools in existence need fine tuning and also a process-centric approach to make them more visible and effective, so that the other Police Schools which may follow in the years to come, would be governed by a set of transparent well defined rules.

**(A) Recommendations to the Mysuru Police-Public School**

1. Design the mission and vision statement of the school on the lines of Sainik Schools.
2. Provide for better infrastructure in the form of smart boards, language lab, library, music, art room and adventure activities on the play ground.
3. Build academic excellence through regular Professional Development programmes for teachers.
4. Provide for improved working conditions for teaching staff by creating regular Posts for teachers and providing pay packages on par with the teachers of Government schools.
5. Provide for transparency in governance by forming a School Management Committee as per the CBSE norms. Hold two to three meetings every academic year and incorporate their suggestions.
6. Create a model of school governance which is process- oriented.

**(B) Recommendations to the Police-Public School Koramagala**

1. Include academicians from Kendriya Vidyalaya , Jawahar Navodaya Vidyalaya and other eminent institutions in the School Education Management Committee to enhance the overall quality of the school programme.
2. Provide autonomy to the principal for planning, implementation and evaluation of the school programme.
3. Create a process- driven model to ensure that a change in Executive Secretary of the school does not impact the functioning of the school.
4. Lay more emphasis on sports activities by creating sports facilities at par with international standards. Introduce adventure sports to build team work, risk taking and stamina in children.
5. Form a Students Council to bring in democratic governance.

**(C) Recommendations to N A Muttanna Memorial Police Children's Residential School, Dharwar**

1. Enhance the communication skills of students by introducing English Language Improvement Programme across all grades of both Kannada and English medium.
2. Introduce an activity based curriculum where by students are involved in a joyous learning process.
3. Enhance the quality of teaching- learning programme by upgrading the science laboratory, computer laboratory and the library. Introduce life skill classes for all students across different grades.
4. Improve the hostel facilities and provide clean and hygienic physical environment for the students.

5. Provide for additional qualified wardens for educational and psychological support to the hostel children.
6. Lay more emphasis on educational and cultural activities. Provide more opportunities for children to participate in intra -school and inter-school educational and cultural programmes.
7. Form a Students Council and a School Management Committee to introduce democratic school governance.
8. It is recommended to revisit the GO of N A Muttanna Memorial Police Children's Residential school and reconstitute the 18 year old governing body.
9. Create a Day Boarding- cum Residential School for a financially viable self sustaining model.
10. In view of reducing demand for Kannada Medium courses, there is need to revisit the policy of earmarking the number of students to be admitted for Kannada Medium courses.

### **Recommendations for all the three Police Schools**

1. Bring all the Police Schools under one umbrella/ apex body with the respective SP's forming a part of the governing council to ensure uniformity in academic governance and administrative matters.
2. Create a Central Cell to govern the curriculum of all the Police Schools and ensure quality delivery.

### **Conclusions**

- ✓ The evaluation of the three Police Schools reveals that Police-Public school is an assured model to impart affordable quality education to the wards of Police Personnel. These schools are a solace for the hard working Police man who is freed from the worries of educating his wards. With escalating

cost of education coupled with a lack of quality assurance in both government and private schools, the Police-Public School is a model to stay.

- ✓ However, these schools need to be envisioned to bring in a beautiful synthesis of academic excellence and deep rooted Indian values. Presently, each school is working as an individual entity struggling to put its processes in place. As the schools lift themselves from one phase of development to a higher phase, it becomes imperative to create a more cohesive model, that shelters these schools from academic and administrative vagaries and build on a system that nurtures the blooming of these schools. The schools should enhance their curricular programme and deliver a high quality educational programme to attract a wider stratum of student population.
- ✓ Depending on the need similar PPS could be replicated in other districts of Karnataka to provide affordable education to the wards of lower wrung of Police Personnel. A financial model needs to be created wherein the dependence on the government is minimal.

## **Major Findings and Discussions**

On the basis of the data analyses, the following are the major findings of the study:-

**1. Study and analyses the profile of students' and parents and their status in the department. Identify characteristic features of the profiles. To understand the predominant strata of the Police Personnel admitting their wards to these schools.**

- Majority (80% to 90%) of the Police students studying in each of the three Police Schools were wards of Police Constables. Less than 10% of the Police students in each of the three Police Schools were wards of Head Constables. Wards of ASI / PSI / ASP and DSP constituted less than 5% of the total strength of Police students in each of the three Police Schools.

**2. Study and analyze present Teacher- Student ratio being maintained in each of these schools and identify variations/deviations from the established norms, including identification of reasons for such deviations.**

- In the year 2014-2015, Teacher-Student ratio was 1:27 at Mys PPS, 1:24 at Kor PPS and 1:17 at N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar. The ideal Teacher- Student ratio is 1:15. However, it is not uncommon to maintain a ratio of 1: 25 (Number of teachers to number of students) or 1:30 in Private schools for creating a financially viable model. Dearth of competent qualified teachers, limited spectrum of curricular programmes and additional financial burden on salary expenditure were the reasons cited by the principals of Mys PPS and Kor PPS for deviating from the prescribed norms of TeacherStudent ratio.

**3. Study and review present staff strength vis a vis number of classes and students in each of the school, carry out critical analysis of adequacy of teaching staff vis-à-vis standard norms and ideal staffing pattern required. Also study the staffing of similar schools in the vicinity with a comparison between PPS and other schools and identify deficiencies.**

- The number of teaching staff in Mys PPS and N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar were less than the prescribed norms of the CBSE (For every two sections three teachers) and the State Board respectively. However, there may not have been any significant impact of this deviation on the quality of teaching- learning environment as the number of children in the higher sections (Grade VII and above) were below the required class strength of 30- 35 students. In Kor PPS, the number of teaching staff in the academic year 2014-2015, satisfied the CBSE norms.

During the academic year 2014-15, contractual teaching staff constituted 50% of the total staff strength in Mys PPS and N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar, while it was around 20% in Kor PPS.

As stated in the limitations of the study, the study of the staffing pattern of a neighbouring school could not be taken up.

**4. Carry out a comparative study of the fee structure adopted by individual schools for different classes, review the basis for the same and identify variations among the selected schools and rationale for such differences.**

- Each of the two Police- Public Schools had designed its own fee policy on the basis of the projections of the number of admissions in the first five years of its inception and the salary expenditure of the teaching staff. In Mys PPS, fee was collected under three broad heads of: (a) Building fund; (b) Admission fees; and, (c) Tuition fees. No significant differences were observed in the admission fee

and tuition fee structure across Grades between Police and non Police Personnel. However, the Building fund paid by the wards of non-Police Personnel was three times higher than the amount paid by the wards of Police Personnel.

- In Kor PPS, for the academic year 2014-2015, the fresh admission seekers in non-Police Personnel category paid higher admission fee than the fresh admission seekers in Police Personnel category, this amount being ten times higher. However, no significant difference was noted in the tuition fee between the two categories. Also, no significant differences were noted in the fees collected from wards of Police and non Police Personnel under different heads like Computer fee, Diary fee, Identity card fee, Medical fee, Sports fee, Magazine fee, Pupil fund fee and Examination fee.

The differential fee structure provided for a financially self sustaining model in Mys PPS and Kor PPS.

#### **5. Identify whether there are provisions for Right to Education and that of cooked mid-day meal and Ksheerbhagya scheme.**

- The Mys PPS and Kor PPS are covered under the RTE act from the year 2013-14. Mid- Day meal facility is provided at N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharawar. Rice and curry is provided to the school daily under the Akhshya Patra scheme.

#### **6. Review the Grade X results of the three Police schools.**

The performance of wards of Police Personnel in the Grade X examination over the last two academic years (2012-13 and 2013-14) has been superior to the performance of wards of non Police Personnel in Mys PPS. Higher percentage of Police wards had secured distinction and first class in comparison to non- Police wards.

In Kor PPS, higher percentage of wards of Police Personnel had secured distinctions in the academic year (2012-13 and 2013-14) in comparison to wards of non Police Personnel.

In N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar, a drop in the percentage of students securing distinctions and first classes was observed in the year 2013- 14 in comparison to the academic year 2012-13.

#### **7. Assess the satisfaction index of teaching staff in discharging their responsibilities and imparting quality education.**

- Teachers of Mys PPS, Kor PPS and N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar expressed that their job as a teacher was challenging due to lack of support from the parents in the education of the child. Teachers shared that they needed more support in the form of resources and training in making learning more joyful for children. Teachers of Mys PPS and N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar expressed dissatisfaction with the pay scales and the benefits offered by the management. They wanted vertical growth, job enrichment and collaboration with other Police Schools.

The contractual staff at Mys PPS and Kor PPS articulated that they felt insecure in their job and unhappy with the pay package offered to them. However, teachers of all the three Police Schools expressed that they did not allow paucity of resources or their job dissatisfaction to hamper their curricular transactions.

#### **8. Study the availability of infrastructure in terms of premises, classrooms, library, playground, labs and others like sports, curricular activities and other facilities, in each of the schools, identify shortcomings/ inadequacies in infrastructure availability, including the assessment of the problems and constraints for smooth functioning of the schools for want of adequate facilities.**

- All the three Police Schools lacked a vision statement. The absence of a vision statement has diluted the focus of curricular programme.

Infrastructure of all the three Police Schools needs to be enhanced to provide quality education. The infrastructural facilities at Kor PPS were found to be better than Mys PPS. Kor PPS had well organized science lab, a well maintained, organized library and an upcoming language lab. Technology enabled classrooms were absent in Kor PPS and Mys PPS. No organized rooms for creative expressions like dance, music or art were seen in both the schools. The absence of these facilities is a hindrance in the smooth functioning of the school and in the overall development of the students. The facilities at N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar were below the required standards and is severely impacting the quality of educational delivery. Classrooms were poorly lit with lack of proper ventilation. Though the sports rooms had different sports equipments like volleyball, basketball, lazim, dumbbells etc, there were no proper storage racks for the sports equipment. Science laboratory was not organized. More than 65% of the books in the library were text books. The hostel was in a pathetic shape with poorly maintained dormitory rooms, no proper ventilation, absence of storage racks, broken toilets and insects in the dining area.

All the three Police Schools lacked a well developed sports ground. No facilities were created for adventure and risk taking activities in spite of the large grounds that each of the schools enjoyed.

**9. Carry out qualitative assessment of the satisfaction levels and perceptions of the students and their parents about the school in terms of infrastructure and other facilities. Draw a comparison between PPS and other schools in the vicinity with similar size and strength of teachers and students, identify shortcomings.**

Students at Mys PPS were extremely happy with the school programme. They expressed that the school had provided them with lots of opportunities to explore their talents. Parents of wards of Police Personnel too expressed happiness with the

school programme. They however wanted the school to provide for technology enabled classrooms and lay more emphasis on music, dance and other forms of creative expressions.

Students and parents of Kor PPs wanted improved infrastructural facilities like smart classes, computer lab with advanced computers and an auditorium. They were happy with the activities conducted in the school.

Students of N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar expressed unhappiness with the quality of infrastructure. They mentioned that the classrooms, computer lab and the library were below the average standards. Parents too expressed unhappiness over the hostel facilities and the infrastructure of the school.

The Presentation school, studied as a parallel school to Mys PPS is affiliated to CBSE board. It had a fee structure similar to Mys PPS. Infrastructure was good with well developed library, laboratory and an advanced computer room. The school had technology enabled classrooms. No information could be obtained on the sources of income for the school.

A comparative study of Kor PPS with a school in the vicinity could not be done as the school managements did not grant permission to the researcher to conduct the study.

**10. Study and review the present system/ arrangements in respect of teacher training programmes and up gradation of their teaching skills and faculties and identify shortcomings in the present system and suggestions for improving the quality of teaching in these schools.**

- Each of the three Police Schools had its own arrangement for teacher training and skill up gradation. Teachers of Mys PPS and Kor PPS underwent 3-6 training cycles every academic year on topics related to classroom practices. The training programmes were conducted by private organizations and individual consultants.

The training programmes were organized for a duration of one to three days depending on the selected module for training.

The training programmes for teachers at N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar were conducted by the DIET and DSERT.

None of the three schools had adopted a 'Need assessment policy' to identify the areas for training. Also, there was no specific methodology to identify the extent to which the teachers were transferring the skills learnt during training to the classrooms.

### **11. Review the overall development of students of the three Police Schools.**

- The overall development of the students of Mys PPS was good. The confidence level of the students was high. They had good communication skills and could articulate their thoughts very clearly. Ample opportunities were given by the school to the students to explore their talents. Students had bagged many prizes in interschool educational and cultural programmes and at district level sports competitions.

Students of Kor PPS were confident and displayed good communication skills.

They had participated actively in educational and cultural competitions at interschool and district levels. However, the participation of students in sports competitions at district, state and national level was found to be low.

The students of N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar had problems communicating in English. Majority of the students lacked the confidence to freely express their thoughts. The physical development of the students was good. Participation of the students in sports events was high in comparison to educational and cultural events. Students had bagged many prizes at state and national level sports competitions.

**12 Carry out a critical study of the present rationale and basis of determining the fee structure and other charges being collected from the students and compare the overall cost of education to the Police Personnel. Also, hold interactions with the parents, guardians, teachers and students on the fee structure and the overall cost of education to the wards of Police Personnel vis-à-vis others. In other words, carry out a quick opinion survey to identify the perceptions of stake holders about the cost aspects of PPS.**

In MYS PPS, over the last five years, the wards of non-Police Personnel paid approximately three times more fees than the wards of Police- Personnel. Though both the categories paid almost the same tuition fees and admission fees, there was a differential building fund fee collected from the Police and non-Police Personnel. The Police Personnel paid one third of the building fund fees charged to the non-Police Personnel.

In Kor PPS, the fee difference between the new admission Police wards and non Police wards in the academic year 2014-2015 was approximately Rs 33, 000. The admission fees for the non-Police wards was almost ten times higher than the Police wards. The fee difference in the academic year 2014- 2015 between the regular Police and non-Police wards was approximately Rs 8000 . There were no differences in the fee collected under miscellaneous heads like computer fee, Diary fee, exam fees, sports fee, magazine fee, medical fee, pupil fund and identity card fees.

The fee difference between Police wards and non-Police wards in Kor PPS had steadily increased over the last five years. The difference was almost tenfold in the last three years.

Over the last two academic years, Mys PPS and Kor PPS has been maintaining their admissions at 30:70 ratio for non- Police wards and Police wards respectively.

The fee structure adopted by the schools has created an economically viable model in both the schools.

The overall cost of education to the wards of Police Personnel was found to be reasonable in comparison to the fee structure of a private school with similar infrastructure.

In Mys PPS, the parents of wards of Police Personnel expressed for a reduction in school fees citing that the school was a welfare institution run by the Police department. The non-Police parents articulated that the school should adopt a common fee structure for both the categories. Police and non Police parents expressed that the school should not charge admission fees every academic year. The teachers expressed that the fee structure for the non-Police wards should be increased.

In Kor PPS, the parents of wards of Police Personnel and non Police Personnel expressed satisfaction with the fee policy adopted by the school. Teachers did not express any specific opinion on the fee policy.

**13 Make an attempt to assess the number of students pursuing higher studies, particularly, engineering and medicine, after passing out from the PPS.**

- There is no Alumni Association in the three Police Schools. The information about the ex-students were obtained from the Principals of the concerned schools. It was mentioned by the principal of N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS, Dharwar that an ex-student was pursuing civil service. The principal of Kor

PPS expressed that, some of the students were pursuing professional courses. *The reliability of the data could not be established.*

**14. Seek the opinion of the students, their parents/guardians/ teachers on Police-Public schools being modeled like Sainik Schools**

- The students, parents/ guardians, teachers unanimously expressed that they wanted the school to be modeled in the lines of Sainik School.

**15. Draw a comparison between the Police- Public School and another school in the vicinity with respect to student strength, number of teachers, fee structure and infrastructure.**

- The Presentation School, studied as a parallel school to Mys PPS is affiliated to CBSE board. It had a fee structure similar to Mys PPS. Infrastructure was good with well developed library, laboratory and an advanced computer room. The school had technology enabled classrooms. No information could be obtained on the source of income.

**Note: Objectives number 16 and 17 addressed under Discussions**

**In case of N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar**

**18. Review the pattern of funding to this school by the Government of Karnataka and the basis thereof and determine whether the present quantum is adequate to manage the school effectively and efficiently and whether the present norms are in, keeping with the need for imparting quality education.**

- The salary grants showed a decline over a four year period viz 2010-11 to 2013-14. In the year 2014-15 there was an increase in the salary grant. There has been a steady increase in the non-salary grants over the five year period. The present grant provided by the GOK is not sufficient for imparting quality education. **No data on utilization of the grant was provided by the school**

**19. Study the trends of students seeking admissions in this school vis-à-vis actual availability of seats and number of outsiders and Police wards**

**whose applications were not considered for admission and explore feasibility of reserving certain number of seats for wards of general public and if so determining percentages.**

- The school admits only wards of Police Personnel. The number of applications received for admissions has not crossed 110 in the last five years. Almost 70 % of the applications received were converted into admissions in the academic year 2014-2015. The total strength of the students has not reached the requisite number of 250 as specified in the GO of 1997.

Majority of the Students admitted over the last five years were wards of Police Constables. The wards of Head Constables formed less than 21% of the total Police Students admitted in each academic year. The maximum rank in the Police department, who had admitted their wards to the Police School (in the academic year 2014-15), was ASI/PSI (Feasibility of reserving certain number of seats to Public mentioned in Discussions)

**20. Compare the results, Teacher- Student ratio, infrastructure facilities, hostel accommodation, mess facilities and satisfaction perception of students and parents with Morarji Desai Residential School, Dharwar.**

- Over the last five years, N A Muttanna PCRS Dharwar had a higher percentage of students securing distinctions than MDRS Dharwar. There were also lesser percentage of pass classes in N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar in comparison to MDRS Dharwar.

Infrastructure in terms of building, classrooms, laboratory, Library was superior in MDRS Dharwar in comparison to N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS, Dharwar. The hostel facilities at MDRS Dharwar were also superior to N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS Dharwar with bunker beds, clean toilets and well maintained hostel rooms. The hostel at N A Muttanna Memorial PCRS, Dharwar was in a pathetic shape with poorly maintained dormitory rooms, no proper ventilation, broken toilets and

insects in the dining area. There was no proper monitoring of the study time. Medical facility at the hostel premises was basic. The reporting system to parents was a major concern. The above conditions are detrimental to the educational and emotional development of students.

No significant difference was observed in the staffing pattern between the two schools.

Both the schools gave lots of emphasis on sports. Students had bagged many prizes at District and State level competitions. MDRS Dharwar students had bagged an award for their environmental friendly practices.

### **Additional objective**

#### **21. Study the Government High School, Police Colony, Magadi Road in terms of infrastructure, students admission and facilities available.**

- The Government High School located in Police Colony; Magadi Road is on half an acre of land. The school has a ground but had no organized facilities for games. The school had an AV room and a well organized library with more than five thousand books. The computer lab was non-functional.

The number of students seeking admission to the school had reduced over the last three years with a decline in Kannada medium students. The reason cited by the principal was the opening of Government schools in the vicinity. Wards of Police personnel constituted less than 10% of the total student strength over the last three years.