

Evaluation Study on Santwana Centers
Women and Child Development Department

Executive Summary

The Santwana Programme started in 2001-02 as a welfare programme for the women who are subjected to atrocities like rape, domestic violence, dowry, sexual harassment, etc. The programme designed to provide legal assistance, support, financial aid, temporary shelter & protection and training / education to equip them with skills needed to get back into the normal course of life. The programme is being implemented through NGO's across Karnataka State. The government envisaged an evaluation of the scheme to assess its effectiveness and make further reforms required so that the intended objective is achieved.

Survey Methodology

The programme is operational in 170 centers across the state. A sample of 66 Santwana Centers spread over 29 districts of the state was selected at random and about 408 affected women were selected at random and interviewed to assess the impact of the scheme. Structured data collection formats were developed to collect information at different levels – Department, NGO and Affected Women.

Profile of Santwana Centers

The sample santwana centers visited have been in **operation** since 2001 the start year of the programme and the latest being in 2013 indicating the NGO's exposure to Santwana Programme implementation range from 1 to 13 years. These NGO's have been working in other development sector activities and some are working prior to the independence to the latest year 2011. The sample Santwana Centers surveyed are located mostly in rented buildings (92%). The geographical areas of operation of the santwana centers are mostly within the taluks where they are located. In few cases it caters to the needs of the entire district. All the sample

santwana centers are functioning as per the guidelines and it is observed that 96% of the centers are functioning all through the days. Two of the three coordinating facilities namely the Government Hospital and Police Station are at an easy accessible distance, while, the distance to the Swadhaar Center is about 45 kilometers. All the centers have temporary shelter facilities for the stay of affected women who come in for support. In most of the cases they will be staying for a day or two and if the problems persist then they will be shifted to the nearest Stay Homes or Swadhaar centers or Ujwala Centers. All the centers have basic facilities such as telephone, furniture, toilet etc., so that the stay for the affected women is not hampered.

As per the guideline the social workers and the family counselor who are the core staff of the Santwana centre are in place in all the sample centers. The average experience of the female family counselors in community development activities is 7 years as compared to 3 years for males. In case of social workers it is about 5 years for both male and females. The literacy levels of the family counselors are mostly Post Graduates (79%) with either Social work or sociology backgrounds. There are few family counselors with legal qualification. In case of Social Workers, the qualification is mostly PUC (44%) & Graduation (39%). Trainings have been provided to the staff of the Santwana centers on various topics spread over 1 to 7 days. The number of training programmes attended by the social workers ranges up to 12 as against 30 programmes attended by the family counselors.

All the santwana centers are maintaining the different types of documents specified in the programme guidelines. The NGO's are implementing many other programmes in the education, watershed, health, rural development, agriculture and women & child development areas. The funding for these programmes varies from the central government, state government, Zilla Panchayat and other national & international donor organizations.

It is reported by 50 (76%) centers that the income source is only the government grants received for running the center. While in other cases the implementing organizations have given as loans & advances to the centers or collecting funds from community & donors. The average income received per centre from all sources during the last five years is Rs.2.62 lakh per annum which comprises mainly the income received from the government to the extent of nearly Rs.2.5 lakh. The income received from the government is mainly for salary of the three social workers & the family counselor, telephone expenses, rent of the building and other contingency expenses. The average expenditure of the centers over the last five years has been over Rs.2.5 lakhs and varies in the range of Rs.24000 to Rs.7.72 lakhs. The item-wise expenditure indicates that expenditure on remuneration of the staff members is the major item of expenditure constituting 68% followed by office rent (9%).

Profile of Sample Affected Women

The sample affected women comprises of OBC's in majority followed by SC, Muslims and ST's. The average age is 31 years and ranges between 15 and 70 years. The literacy rate among the sample is 84% and across the different social groups, it is highest among the OBC (90%) followed by General Group (88%). The different literacy levels among the sample show that one third has education up to 7th standard while 22% have studied up to SSLC. It is reported by 13% of the sample women that they have completed PUC and few have reported graduate and higher education. The average age at marriage of the sample affected women is 20 years and the average number of years since the marriage of sample affected women is 11 years.

Sixty Eight percent of the sample affected women have children of different age and gender. The total number of children among the affected women having children is 492 (53% - male and 47% -females). It is seen that the 39% of the

affected women having children are single child mother as against 44% have two children and 17% with 3 children. The average age of the children of affected women is 11 years and 60% of the children are up to 10 years of age while more than one third up to 5 years. The occupational structure of the children shows that over 50% are students studying at various levels while more than one fourths is depending on the affected women. Nearly 15% of the children are reported to be earning for their livelihood. However, the support to the affected women by these earning members is not reported.

Access to Services

The affected women are getting all the available services from the santwana center – helpline utility, counseling, training, legal support etc.

Programmes for Women in Distress

There are many welfare programmes for women being implemented under state and central schemes. Programmes related to women in distress that are being implemented with the central funding – Ujjawala, Swaadhar and Short Stay Home. Financial support under all these programmes is different but the objective is same. In addition the Mahila Sahaya Vani programme supports the women in distress by providing rehabilitation measures and legal aid if required. These programmes under the different names are being implemented by the NGO's under different funding sources. Also some NGO's are implementing more than one of these programmes.

Recommendation

1. Convergence of Programmes

The convergence of Santwana Programme with other central programmes – Ujjawala, Swaadhaar and Stay Homes could be thought of as all these programmes are focusing on the same issue of women in distress. It is observed that some of the NGO's are implementing some of these programmes along with the Santwana

programme. For example IDARY an NGO in Shiggaon in Haveri district is also implementing Ujwala and Short Stay Home programme, while the Pragna Counselling Centre in Mangalore is implementing Swaadhar and Destitute Cottage programmes.

2. Involvement of Taluk Level Personnel

Taluk Level Officers of Women & Child Development Department need to be given the time bound responsibility of checking the functioning and monitoring of Santwana centres and the cases registered by them.

3. 1091 Helpline Number

The Santwana helpline number 1091 needs to be made fully functional as it is not operational in many places and NGO's have given their landline and personnel mobile numbers to the community.

4. Training

There is a need for imparting more and refresher trainings regularly to Santwana centre staff.

The type training provided to women needs to be rethought of. Instead of the old but now not relevant skills of Agarbathy making and candle making, more relevant employment providing skill trainings may be given using convergence with Skill Development Corporation.

5. Implementation

NGO's focusing on more than one centre and one programme has to be discouraged. Because NGO's cannot monitor the work effectively and also the turnover of the staff members will be high.

6. District Level Meetings

In each district there can be one Committee that would monitor the functioning of all women welfare related schemes, instead of a Committee for each scheme under women welfare. Santwana should be reviewed by this Committee.

7. Compensation to Affected Women

The compensation provided to affected women needs to be enhanced and District Level Committee should be authorized to sanction it.

8. NGO's Involvement

- NGO's have to engage qualified social workers as in some cases, ITI trained, under graduates working in the same NGO, accounts personnel of the NGO etc are working as social workers.
- Leverage other skill development programmes for economic rehabilitation – Stree Sakthi, Skill Development programmes of Don Bosco, RUDSET, NSDC etc.,
- Appoint a legal advisor for effective legal counseling in line with social workers and family counselor
- There is no system for following up cases settled by Santwana centres. It is particularly important that counseled cases be followed up in a subtle way, lest things return to the old state or get aggravated.

9. Honorarium to Staff

The honoraria provided to Counselor and staff of the centre needs to be enhanced as the activities require qualified personnel and also needs more travel and coordination with the different departments and community.

10. Involvement of Corporate Organizations

Corporate Organisations could be involved under Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) activities. This will help in providing skill development training and further economic rehabilitation.

Conclusion

This section concludes based on the analyses made in the previous sections and focussing the evaluation questions as specified in the TOR.

i. Are the Santwana Centers functioning as per the guidelines? Are they working 24x7?

All the sample santwana centers are functioning as per the guidelines and it is observed that 96% of the centers are functioning all through the days while few are not. The centres not functioning 24X7 are the following:

1. Pragna Counselling Centre, Mangalore
2. Santhwana Mahila Vedike, Sirsi
3. Mahila Santwana Kendra, Gulbarga

The NGO Pragna Counselling Centre is also running the Swaadhar center and the Destitute Cottage programmes of the department. Hence, during the night times the calls coming to the Santwana center are diverted to the Swaadhar center.

The Santwana Center in Sirsi faced a unique problem during January 2014 when one of the affected women who had come to the centre was murdered by her husband. This necessitated the functioning of the center only during day times. However it is informed that if any urgent cases come in the night they will attend to it.

ii. Are the promised support and facilities actually provided by Santwana Centers?

As seen in the previous sections the Santwana Centers are functioning and are providing services as per the guidelines. These relates to registering telephone calls and responding to it, providing awareness through different methods, supporting the affected women for shelter, intervening to solve the cases by themselves or through legal or other methods, providing skill training and economic support during distress.

iii. How many people have benefitted from the scheme so far?

The growth in the number of cases registered and solved over the last five years indicates both the indicators are increasing. The percentage of cases solved is 80%. It is seen that all the incoming calls are not converted to cases and registered. About one fourth of the incoming calls are registered in to cases for further investigation and counseling.

iv. What proportion and how well are the victims finally rehabilitated by the NGOs?

It is reported that the affected women are provided training in various income generating activities such as Agarbathi & Appalam Making, Tailoring, Beauty Parlour, Mehandi, Toy Making, Computer DTP , Dairy Farming etc.,

Also coordinated and supported some of the affected women for getting employment in Garments factory, Food Processing industry, Hostel cook and Computer teacher. As seen from the profile of the sample affected women 11% have received skill training and 50% of these are generating income from the skill training they received.

v. What is the per person cost for successful rehabilitation?

The expenditure data on individual rehabilitation cases are not available with the centers. However the cost of investment per affected women is analyzed based on the efforts put in and the income received and the expenditure incurred by the center. The efforts put in by the center are seen in-terms of number of cases registered and solved. This analysis is given in the following Table-10.1. As seen from the table the average income received per affected women during the last five years based on the data on registered cases & solved cases and the per capita expenditure is almost matching with the income received showing that all the income received is spent.

Table-10.1: Per Case Income and Expenditure (Rs)

Year	No. of Cases Registered	No. of Cases Solved	Income (Rs.)	Expenditure (Rs.)	Income per Registered Case	Expenditure per Registered Case	Difference in Budget based on Registered Cases	Income per Solved Case	Expenditure per Solved Case	Difference in Budget based on Solved Cases
2009-10	5770	4585	8215158	9623498	1424	1668	-244	1792	2099	-307
2010-11	5849	4874	15969417	13027534	2730	2227	503	3276	2673	604
2011-12	8688	7585	14491928	15174878	1668	1747	-79	1911	2001	-90
2012-13	14419	11497	15835172	15367112	1098	1066	32	1377	1337	41
2013-14	14576	11666	15609266	16055961	1071	1102	-31	1338	1376	-38
2009-14	49302	40207	70120941	69248983	1422	1405	18	1744	1722	22

vi. How satisfied are the inmates of Santwana Centers with the quality of the services?

Most of the sample women have expressed full satisfaction with the implementation of the programme and the services provided by the centers.

vii. In case the affected woman is not able to lead a satisfactory life, what other alternative interventions are taken up by the Santwana Centers?

It is seen that 85% of the cases are solved within a period of three months. This shows that the affected women are able to lead a satisfactory life. However the unsolved case is 20% based on the Santwana Centers data and 37% based on the sample affected women's survey. This shows that the problems still persists in varying degrees.

viii. After family counseling, how many follow up revisits are paid to the affected women?

The duration of the cases finalization given below indicates the brisk efforts of the center staff in making the affected women to get justice at the earliest.

Less than a month – 67% of the cases;

Up to three months – 18% of the cases;

Up to a Year – 13% of the cases;

More than a Year – 8% of the cases;

ix. What is the performance rating of different NGOs in implementing Santwana effectively?

There are many parameters on which the performance of can be assessed. However quantification or categorisation of the parameters is important to generate a score for the variable. It is observed that all the Santwana Centres are putting efforts to achieve the main objectives of the programme. However, there are some differences in the overall performance. To grade the Santwana Centres based on the performance, the following indicators are selected which are quantifiable or categorical:

- 1) Santwana Centres Location (Own / Rented Building);
- 2) Availability of Shelter Facility;
- 3) Experience of Social Workers in the centre;
- 4) Experience of Family Counsellor in the centre;
- 5) Training to Social Workers under the programme;

- 6) Training to Family Counsellor under the programme;
- 7) Number of Incoming Calls;
- 8) Number of Outgoing Calls;
- 9) Percentage of Cases Solved

x. Are the staffs employed at the Santwana Centers aware of different schemes being implemented by the other departments which can benefit the deserving women?

All the staffs of the Santwana centers are aware of the different programmes implemented for the benefit of women. This is based on the prior experiences of the staff in development activities and also the trainings provided by the WCWD under the programme.

xi. Are the other Departments providing sufficient co-operation to the NGOs?

During the survey it was elicited from the NGO's about the perception of different organizations at the district and lower levels regarding the coordination and support during the implementation of the programme. The responses are varying across the centers. Some of the main responses about the perception are highlighted below:

➤ **Police Department**

After getting training they are co-operating well

Average response to some cases do not co-operate well

Co-operate only when there is pressure from higher authority Do not support, they neglect & do not respond properly

Face problem during the absence of sub-inspector

Good co-operation, visit directly to santwana regarding some cases

➤ **Revenue Department**

Average response

Co-operate in property related issues Good co operation

No need of this department

Widow, old age pension etc will be sanctioned quickly

➤ **Health Department**

100% co-operation in providing free treatment to women All help is provided

Co-operate well in case of getting any report related to cases DHO will react well & give good support

Provide training to Asha workers to create awareness in women

➤ **WCW Department**

100% support from this department

Getting good co-operation by the CDPO

Programmes conducted for awareness of women's harrasment

Protection of child marriage, solution for problems

Provide training through meetings in district centres

Provide training to the santwana staff & help to provide guidance

Providing education and hostel facilities to children's of affected women

➤ **Legal Department**

100% free legal help

Conduct legal awareness program to women Good co-operation in solving cases

Respond well

They provide good co-operation & give unsolved cases to santwana

➤ **Gram Panchayat**

Co-operate in solving problems that arise within the GP Good co-operation

GP members & president will support well

GP will give cases & co-operate in solving them

➤ **Political Leaders**

Co-operate well

Give cases to municipal counselors

No interference of politicians

Village leaders, politicians provide good co-operation

xii. Is there any overlap of Santwana Scheme benefits with any other scheme/ Department?

The santwana scheme being unique to the department no other state government department is implementing similar programme. However the Ujjawala, Short Stay Home and the Swaadhar programmes of Government of India is overlapping with the Santwana programme.

xiii. Whether there is sufficient awareness about Santwana Scheme in the general public?

The awareness campaigns by the NGO's, Department, Police and the media have provided wide publicity of the Santwana Programme among the general public. As seen from the responses of the sample affected women the different channels of publicity are through:

- Neighbour
- Family Members
- Awareness Camp of NGO
- Friend
- Anganwadi
- Mahila Sangha Member
- Police

- Affected Women
- Lawyer
- News Paper
- Asha Worker
- GP
- Doctor
- TV
- Hospital

xiv. What proportionate of the victims are denied admission and for what reasons?

It is reported that no case will be denied for admission excepting cases which are in court. Among the sample santwana centers visited in 3 centers only admission was denied due to the following reasons:

- One case was denied due to video of a women
- One came for anganawadi helper job
- Denied 4 cases which were 2nd marriage & illegal relationship

xv. How Santwana Scheme could be implemented better in the future?

The responses of the NGO's and the District level staff of WCWD indicates that the programme is functioning well and delivering the needs of the affected women. However they feel that the implementation could be made better with the following additional support from the government:

- Awareness Camps to be intensified
- More Training for the staff
- Vehicle for NGO for accessing to the affected women and also to Swaadhar Centres which are at distance
- Legal advisor for the Santwana Centre
- Shelter facility at the taluk level
- Increase in the funds for the Santwana Center as most of the costs are raising
- Security from police during visits to sensitive places
- ID Cards for the staff
- Security of Job for the staff so that turnover of the staff will be reduced

Recommendation

Based on the analyses of the data presented in the previous chapters, the following recommendation would enhance the effectiveness of the Santwana Programme:

1. Convergence of Programmes

The convergence of Santwana Programme with other central programmes – Ujjawala, Swaadhaar and Stay Homes could be thought of as all these programmes are focusing on the same issue of women in distress. It is observed that some of the NGO's are implementing some of these programmes along with the Santwana programme. For example IDARY an NGO in Shiggaon in Haveri district is also implementing Ujjawala and Short Stay Home programme, while the Pragna Counselling Centre in Mangalore is implementing Swaadhaar and Destitute Cottage programmes.

2. Involvement of Taluk Level Personnel

Taluk Level Officers of Women & Child Development Department need to be given the time bound responsibility of checking the functioning and monitoring of Santwana centres and the cases registered by them.

3. 1091 Helpline Number

The Santwana helpline number 1091 needs to be made fully functional as it is not operational in many places and NGO's have given their landline and personnel mobile numbers to the community.

4. Training

- There is a need for imparting more and refresher trainings regularly to Santwana centre staff.
- The type training provided to women needs to be rethought of. Instead of the old but now not relevant skills of Agarbathy making and candle making, more relevant employment providing skill trainings may be given using convergence with Skill Development Corporation.

5. Implementation

- NGO's focusing on more than one centre and one programme has to be discouraged. Because NGO's cannot monitor the work effectively and also the turnover of the staff members will be high.

6. District Level Meetings

In each district there can be one Committee that would monitor the functioning of all women welfare related schemes, instead of a Committee for each scheme under women welfare. Santwana should be reviewed by this Committee.

7. Compensation to Affected Women

The compensation provided to affected women needs to be enhanced and District Level Committee should be authorized to sanction it.

8. NGO's Involvement

- NGO's have to engage qualified social workers as in some cases, ITI trained, under graduates working in the same NGO, accounts personnel of the NGO etc are working as social workers.
- Leverage other skill development programmes for economic rehabilitation – Stree-Sakthi, Skill Development programmes of Don Bosco, RUDSET, NSDC etc.,
- Appoint a legal advisor for effective legal counseling in line with social workers and family counsellor
- There is no system for following up cases settled by Santwana centres. It is particularly important that counseled cases be followed up in a subtle way, lest things return to the old state or get aggravated.

9. Honorarium to Staff

The honoraria provided to Counselor and staff of the centre needs to be enhanced as the activities require qualified personnel and also needs more travel and coordination with the different departments and community.

10. Involvement of Corporate Organizations

- Corporate Organisations could be involved under Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) activities. This will help in providing skill development training and further economic rehabilitation.