

## Executive Summary

NABCONS has been retained by the Karnataka Evaluation Authority (KEA) to undertake ‘*Evaluation study of Employment training imparted under Skill Training and Placement component of National Urban Livelihood Mission*’ implemented during the period 2014-15 by the Directorate of Municipal Administration. The overall objective of this assignment is to evaluate the impact of the scheme on the individual beneficiaries.

The study was mounted to evaluate the quality of training so as to assess whether the training enabled the beneficiaries to have gainful employment or self-employment impacting improvement in their livelihood on a sustainable basis. Further, the study was undertaken to ascertain whether the self-employed after training received institutional credit facility. Besides, it aimed at identifying the constraints in implementation and to suggest measures for the improvement of the existing scheme.

The methodology used for the study, as proposed in the TOR included survey of beneficiaries, focus group discussions with the stakeholders and beneficiaries, documenting a few success stories. The sampling method used in this study is systematic random sampling. There are 35 NULM cities in which the EST&P component of NULM is implemented. These cities are grouped into 4 revenue divisions for sampling purpose. 11 cities fall under Bengaluru division and 8 cities each under other three revenue division. Purposive sampling is adopted to select 3 cities/urban centres from each of the revenue divisions, but from Bengaluru division 4 cities are selected, such that they cover all the skills in which trainings are imparted. As per TOR, a sample of 470 beneficiaries were to be covered. However, 518 beneficiaries across the sampled 13 urban centres were covered under the study.

### **An overview of the findings vis-a-vis the objectives of the programme are:**

#### ***Provide an asset to the urban poor in the form of skills for sustainable livelihood.***

The study has clearly indicated that skills imparted through the programme are really an asset to the urban poor. There are about 68 courses approved under the programme with varied duration ranging from 120 to 430 hours. All the Skill Training Providers have followed the approved curriculum. The sample beneficiaries are satisfied with the quality of training imparted by the Institutes.

***Increase the income of urban poor through structured, market-oriented certified courses that can provide salaried employment and / or self-employment opportunities***

All the approved courses are designed to improve the skillset of the individual which has helped the trainee get salaried employment or self-employment opportunities. Most of the sample beneficiaries acknowledged that the training undergone has helped in improving their employability quotient and many have been employed. 63.5% of the sample beneficiaries secured employment. Some of them have also taken up self-employment, particularly those who have undergone LMV and Construction courses. However, the study has revealed that some beneficiaries (Department of Health) under the scheme have successfully completed the training but do not have employment opportunities viz., 'Nursing aids', 'Health care multipurpose worker', 'Midwifery assistant'. The certificates issued by RDAT Hyderabad are not recognised by the private or government hospitals, as the course duration is less than 6 months and do not have a component of internship. Hence, course module of such trainings may be modified to meet the industry standards and requirements.

***Ensure inclusive growth with increased contribution of skilled urban poor to the National Economy***

The findings of the study has brought out that the programme has been highly beneficial for the urban poor targeting the people from BPL families. As per the data furnished, the coverage under women was 42% as against the norm of 30% and 21% under minority category against the requirement of 15%. The programme has undoubtedly benefited the poor urban youth.

**The Overall Findings of the study are given below:**

1. As per the field observations, ULBs created awareness about the programme in their area of operation through TV, local cable operator, Newspaper, SHGs, Pamphlets, Notice Board in ULB and wall paintings. The major source of knowledge about the conduct of training programme was from Newspapers/pamphlets (37.8%), through friends & relatives (31.9%), and through CMC (18.3%). The field study indicated that awareness created by the ULBs is satisfactory. Due to wide publicity through different medium the target population is aware of the benefits under various schemes applicable to them. Recently, the department has come out with radio jingles to publicise the scheme.

2. As per the terms and conditions of sanctions accorded to enlisted Skill Training Providers, outsourcing for conduct of training is not permitted. Accordingly, no outsourcing was observed in the field except in respect of Keonics who are imparting training through their franchisees. CIPET, conducted the training programmes in Mysore, KSFES in Bangalore, KGTTI in Bangalore and Kalburgi. KSRTC in 4 training centres. RGRHCL have their training institute in Bangalore and they have conducted the training programmes in all the districts with the help of Nirmithi Kendras.

3. In all the sample cases interacted, it was observed that the Training Institution have not charged any fee or collected any charges from the beneficiary. The franchisees of KEONICS have also not levied any additional charges.

4. It was observed that each Training Institution followed its own time table and commenced the trainings as per the local requirement. However, the duration of training i.e. number of hours/days, syllabus, teaching methodology of each training course was similar.

5. The syllabus, training content, duration, methodology was observed to be similar in all the sample cases.

6. The DMA fixed the targets to each ULB and Training Institution based on their capacity & infrastructure. The decision to allot certain courses to a training institution is dependent upon the hardware and software configuration, availability of Faculty support, space and number of machines. As regards LMV training the ULBs decide the Training institute after assessing that the Motor Driving School has valid licence from RTO and is in the business for the last 3 years. Training Institutions like Keonics allocated the target in each urban centre among their franchisees depending upon their capacity and capability.

7. The discussions with ULB officials reveal that the eligibility criteria stipulated in letter no. DMA/UPAMU/EST&P/CR/66/2014-15 dated 10.10.2014 for selecting the candidates have been strictly adhered to. No major deviations were observed in the field visit and among the sample beneficiaries, except in respect of upper age limit.

8. As per the data furnished by DMA the ratio of women and minority was 42.1% and 21% as against the requirement of 30% and 15% respectively. However, in respect of differently abled persons, the performance was not satisfactory, as the achievement was 0.8% only against the

requirement of 3%. Even from the sample studied during the field visit, it was observed that the share of women was 45% and minority was 11.6% while differently abled was 1.2%.

9. 'MargadarshanaSabhe' are conducted by the ULBs to give publicity to the programmes of the department. The preliminary selection of a candidate is done by a Committee consisting of Municipal Commissioner/ Dy.Commissioner, Chief Officer, Representative of Training Institute etc., either through personal interview or scrutiny of the application. The list is then placed before the Committee, City Management Monitoring Unit (CMMU), which will finalise the list of candidates for the Training Programme. Generally, for each approved Training programme additional candidates list is attached as reserve list. In case there is absenteeism or if the candidate leaves the programme after a week, the next candidate in the reserve list is included for the programme. This procedure is being followed as per the field study observations.

10. The field study findings and discussions with Training Institutions indicated that selected candidates not joining the training and candidates leaving the course after joining is not a common phenomenon, though it has happened in certain batches. The major reasons for not joining or leaving after joining the course are as under:

- a.Candidates leave if they find it difficult to cope with the subjects
- b.Due to domestic reasons
- c.Selected by another department which apart from training is giving stipend.
- d.Absence of financial stake/ commitment or penalty has prompted some of the candidates to leave the course in between.
- e.Proper food and accommodation is not provided by the Training Institutes.

Discussions indicated that the absenteeism is more pronounced in outstation residential courses organized at CIPET, Mysore; KSFES, Bangalore; KSRTC training Institutes in four districts.

11. About 46% of the sample, had an educational qualification of SSLC or below SSLC. They have been given training mainly in courses offered by RGRHCL, CIPET, GT&TC, ITI, KSRTC, LMV and Health. Graduates and post graduates accounted for 26 % and 4% respectively who underwent training mainly in courses offered by KEONICS.The male-female ratio in the sample was 55:45. Minority was 11.6% SC/ST - 31.8%, OBC-38.8% and General-17.8%.

12. The field study indicated that about 65% of the beneficiaries were not given soft skills during the training. The interactions with the training institutes indicated that long duration courses generally have this component and some of the institutions are ensuring that this component is included in their curriculum. CIPET beneficiaries acknowledged that they were provided soft skills, while some of the KEONICS beneficiaries acknowledged that they were given training on soft skills. Interactions indicated that communication skills, group discussions, etiquettes, were some of the components which were taught as soft skills.

13. Field study indicated that 63.5% of the sample beneficiaries have secured employment. None of the beneficiaries reported permanent employment in Government/ Board/ Corporation. However, 13 beneficiaries reported they are working in CMC, Board as contract employees. 72.7% of the sample reported that they are employed in private sector. Of the 239 beneficiaries working in private sector, nine beneficiaries reported that they are employed/continuing employment not based on the training received. About 23.4% of the sample indicated that they are self-employed but none of them reported to have secured bank loan.

14. As per the field study findings, only 99 out of 329 employed beneficiaries i.e. 30% of the sample, got employment within one month after completion of Training.

15. Analysis of the Training Institution wise employment indicates that majority of GT&TC, ITI, RGRHCL beneficiaries got employment within one month. As regards KEONICS it is 29%. Data analysis also indicated that those who have SSLC and below qualification have got employment earlier than those who have higher qualifications.

16. As per the guidelines the following skill training providers viz., KGTTI, GT&TC, CIPET, KSFES, RTO (LMV), KSRTC (for HMT), have been authorized to issue certificates. The certification for other skill training providers viz., Government ITIs/ Polytechnic Colleges, KEONICS, DIC, Dept of Health, RUDSET, RGRHCL is to be done by RDAT Hyderabad. Field visit indicated that some of the Institutions viz., ITI/Polytechnic College, RGRHCL have issued the certificates to the candidates after successful completion of the training. They are NCVT recognized and follow the required syllabus. As third party assessment was not done through RDAT Hyderabad, DMA does not recognize the certificates issued by RGRHCL/ ITIs.

17. Only 25% of the sample indicated that they have received the certificate within one month. This includes samples from RSETI, DIC, ITI/Polytechnic College. Though they have received the certificates, it is not through third party assessment. For instance, Polytechnic College Bhadravati has got the Third party assessment done through RDAT Hyderabad subsequently and the certificates were received after a period of 5-6 months. During 2014-15, it was observed that the Third party assessment through RDAT, Hyderabad was delayed. The DMA follows a procedure where they will get the training completion details from the ULBs across the State and consolidate and advise RDAT, Hyderabad for assessment. RDAT, Hyderabad after receipt of the data will assign Assessors to various ULBs. After conduct of examination, the Assessors share the result with RDAT, Hyderabad which in turn issues the certificates to DMA Bangalore for distribution of certificates by various ULBs. The tedious process and red tape had delayed the conduct of examination by the Assessors as also issue of certificates to the candidates.

The candidates trained by KSFES Bangalore have not received the certificates even after a lapse of two years. KSFES has indicated that as per their rules they will not issue a certificate unless full payment is received from the candidates. DMA has paid only 40% as the first instalment and the second instalment of 40% will be released only after issue of certificates to the candidates, while the balance 20% will be released when 50% of the trained candidates are employed. Owing to this impasse, the candidates are sufferers and they have not got any employment till date.

18. The field visits indicated that very few STPs viz., CIPET, KEONICS have some tracking mechanism of successful candidates. Generally, post tracking of successful candidates and assisting them to secure wage employment or facilitating them to obtain financial assistance under any government scheme/banks etc was absent in the field.

19. The field study revealed that in none of the sample cases, the trainees have availed bank loan or subsidy after training for the self-employed under PMEGP.

20. As per the scheme guidelines the Skill Training Providers will get the sanctioned amount in three instalments in the ratio of 40:40:20. This is applicable to all Training providers except LMV and RGRHCL where the instalments will be released in the ratio of 50:30:20. The first release will be after commencement of the training and the second instalment will be released

after certification and the third instalment will be released after 50% of the trained candidates get employment and post placement track is done for 6 months.

Discussions indicated that there is no additional penalty to STPs other than non-release of the third instalment of 20% of the sanctioned amount. In majority of the sample cases, it was observed that DMA had released only the first instalment. It was also reported that as on 30.06.2017 none of the STPs has received all the three instalments, across 35 Urban Centres for the sanctions made during 2014-15.

21. In all the sample cases, there was no failure and all had passed in first attempt. Discussions with the Training Institutes indicated that there are failures in some batches but the percentage of failures is less than 3%. The Training Institute retrains the candidates, without charging any additional fee and ensure that they pass certification exam. This is done mainly because the DMA will not only stop release of 40% of the fees in respect of failed candidate but also recover the first instalment of 40% already released and the examination fee. The discussions indicated that failures are mainly due to delay in conduct of examination by the certifying agency, after the course is completed. In some of the sample cases the delay in conducting the Certificate exam was more than one year.

22. The field study indicated that there is no public domain where the list of all successful candidates with their bio-data, experience and skill set under the programme is published. Some ULBs are conducting the job melas where the unemployed certified candidates register in advance with the department and the prospective employers take part in the mela and select candidates based on skill test, interview etc. Recently Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship has come out with a portal <https://ncvtmis.gov.in> wherein the candidates can register, search for vacancies and apply. Similarly, the Job providers/Establishments can register, post vacancies and access the data of suitable candidates. This portal is for ITI certificate holder who have secured NCVT certificate. DMA may come out with a similar portal for candidates to register with certified skill set with their bio data, the prospective employers will have to access the data base so that they can source their requirement through this portal.

23. The field study indicated that skill gap analysis has not been done to identify the market demand in that particular urban centre. The discussions with the officials indicate that they have not referred to the skill gap analysis prepared by NSDC. They indicated that target is given by

DMA and they try to achieve the same. Sometimes they change the trade allotted by DMA at the district level depending upon the demand. The district level committee headed by Deputy Commissioner has been permitted to change the Trade allotted by DMA.

24. As discussed six skill training providers viz., KGTTI, GT&TC, CIPET, KSFES, RTO (LMV), KSRTC (for HMT), have been authorized to issue certificates. The certification for other skill training providers viz., KEONICS, DIC, Dept of Health and Family Welfare, RGRHCL, Government ITIs/ Polytechnic Colleges, RUDSET is to be done by RDAT Hyderabad. The Certifying agency visits the urban centres and conducts a written examination of the trained candidates and issues the certificates. The DMA is making payment of certification fee directly to RDAT Hyderabad.

Undue delay was observed in the certification process in respect of candidates who had to receive certificates from RDAT Hyderabad. The delay was ranging from 6 months to 2 years after completion of the training which definitely has impacted the employment opportunities. To address this issue DMA may consider enlisting some more agencies for third party assessment.

25. The field study indicated that there is no change in the course content, training syllabus since 2014-15. Discussions with the candidates and Skill Training Providers indicated that the syllabus is comprehensive and there is no need to revise it for the present.

26. The field study revealed that this programme is a boon to the urban poor which has imparted skill training free of cost. The beneficiaries have improved their employability quotient and many of them have improved their economic status. The objectives and the guidelines of the scheme are comprehensive. There is scope for improvement in the procedure followed during implementation of the scheme. The recommendations and changes required are given separately.

### **Major recommendations:**

The study indicates that the targets are set by the DMA at the State level and distributed among the urban centres. The training institutions and targets are set without taking into account the local needs. Some of the important recommendations are as under:

- There is no specific instruction as to who are considered 'urban poor' and what the eligibility criteria is. The Department has to fix appropriate income criterion for identification of urban poor.

- The upper age limit needs to be relaxed and increased to 45 years from the present 35 years. There is potential to skill the age group of 35-45 years, especially urban poor women, which would help them to be economically empowered.
- The DMA may put in place a procedure for the third party assessment to be done on the last day of the training programme. If required they may enlist other suitable agencies for third party assessment.
- There is enormous delay in settlement of claims raised by the STPs. The entire procedure for settlement of claims to be revamped and red tapism to be curtailed. Delegation of power in this regard will facilitate improved delivery under the scheme.
- DMA shall ensure that Skill Training Providers have in place a proper tracking mechanism of the trained candidates. The STPs shall work towards providing job-placement or setting up self-enterprise for all the successful candidates.
- DMA shall ensure that a suitable web portal is designed and placed in public domain indicating the bio-data, skill set of all successful but unemployed trainees. This would help the prospective employers in private/public sector, individual entrepreneurs to source their requirement from the pool of skilled candidates.
- Soft skills training needs to be included in all the training modules as they will facilitate the candidate to improve their employability. Soft skills training course module to include Basic Communication skills (in English and Kannada language), Basic Computer operations (for courses other than computer training), Professional etiquettes, Personality Development & Financial literacy. The soft skills may also include a session on how to write a CV.
- DMA may ensure that the Skill Training Providers give proper food and accommodation to the Trainees.
- The LMV training should also accompany advanced training for obtaining 'yellow badge'. This would facilitate the candidates to get employment as taxi drivers for driving yellow board vehicles.
- Third party assessment on course completion should be taken up on the last day of the training programme or immediately after the programme so that the trainees will get the Certificates on time.

- Training courses like Nursing Aids, Health care multipurpose worker, Midwifery Assistant are not recognized by private hospitals/ Nursing homes and even Government Institutions, as the course duration is less than 6 months and do not have a component of internship. Hence, course module of such trainings may be modified to meet the industry standards and requirements.
- It is observed that similar to Directorate of Municipal Administration, many other departments in Karnataka have also been imparting skill training to the youth. To avoid duplication of efforts and to have focused attention, all training and Skill development programmes may be brought under single umbrella.
- Marketing support to Women entrepreneurs under the Scheme may be extended in coordination with Women and Child Development Department and Trade Related Entrepreneurship Assistance and Development (TREAD) Scheme for Women implemented by Ministry of Micro, Small & Medium Enterprises (MSME).